Mapping the terrain of learning outcomes

Dr Mary Catharine Lennon
Senior Policy Advisor
Postsecondary Education Quality Assessment Board
Government of Ontario

Presented to the Learning Outcomes Assessment Conference
Toronto, Ontario
October 18, 2016
Hype cycle heuristic

Gartner, 2016
Learning outcomes as a policy

• Misdirected
• Misaligned
• Misapplied
• Unexamined

Formulate  Implement  Evaluate
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Structural features</th>
<th>Policy formulation</th>
<th>Implementation</th>
<th>Evaluation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Actors</strong></td>
<td>Focus of expectation</td>
<td>Type of expectation</td>
<td>Common goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Programs</td>
<td>Generic skills</td>
<td>Learning objective</td>
<td>Transparency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutions</td>
<td>Program</td>
<td>Learning outcome</td>
<td>Teaching and learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discipline associations</td>
<td>Discipline</td>
<td>Competency</td>
<td>Institutional improvement/quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality assurance agencies/ accreditation bodies</td>
<td>Institution</td>
<td>System design (i.e. transfer)</td>
<td>Institution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National/jurisdictional governments</td>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>Labour market alignment and economic development</td>
<td>Nation/jurisdiction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International/regional government or non-governmental organisations</td>
<td>Credential</td>
<td>International coordination (and comparison)</td>
<td>International/regional</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Matrix of learning outcomes policy development**
Structural features

• **Actors**
  – Programs, Institutions, Discipline associations, Quality assurance agencies/ accreditation bodies, National/jurisdictional governments, International/regional organisations

• **Focus of expectation**
  – Generic skills, Program, Discipline, Institution, Sector, Credential

• **Type of expectation**
  – Learning objective, Learning outcome, Competency
Policy formulation

• **Goals**
  – Transparency, Teaching and learning, Institutional improvement/quality, System design, Labour market alignment and economic development, International coordination (and comparison)

• **Level of expectation**
  – Student (in course), Student (across courses), Program, Institution, Nation/jurisdiction, International/regional

• **Target audience**
  – Students, Public/employers, Faculty (course design), Program (curriculum development), Institution (quality assurance/accountability), System level (coordination and accountability)

• **Audience needs**
  – Indications of program outcomes, Indications of student capacities, Ways to capture student achievement, Improved Course design, Performance indicators
Implementation

• **Strategy type**
  – Articulation, Implementation, Evaluation

• **Activity**
  – Writing learning outcomes, Curriculum mapping, In class assessments, Course development and program alignment, Demonstrating achievement (i.e.. badges/learning passports), Large scale assessments

• **Expected impact**
  – Better skill-matching in labour market, Improved results of assessments, Alignment of teaching and assessment activities, Improved retention and graduation rates, Improved quality assurance processes, Improved comparative understanding
Evaluation

• **Evidence**
  – Retention and graduation rates, Graduates in field closely aligned to program, Longitudinal or cross-sectional assessments, Faculty/student satisfaction, Number of transfer students/credits awarded, Improved internal and external quality assurance processes

• **Data Collection**
  – Pre and post implementation graduation rates, National graduate survey, Test, Survey, Institutional data, Gap analysis

• **Evaluation of policy success**
  – Are the primary goals being achieved? Are there positive/negative impacts elsewhere? Are there unintended consequences? How can the policy be improved?
Mapping examples

1. OECD’s AHELO Feasibility Study Engineering Strand (AHELO)
# Map of AHELO policy activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Structural features</th>
<th>Policy formulation</th>
<th>Implementation</th>
<th>Evaluation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Actors</strong></td>
<td><strong>Focus of expectation</strong></td>
<td><strong>Type of expectation</strong></td>
<td><strong>Common goals</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Programs</td>
<td>Generic skills</td>
<td>Learning objective</td>
<td>Transparency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutions</td>
<td>Program</td>
<td>Learning outcome</td>
<td>Teaching and learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discipline associations</td>
<td>Discipline</td>
<td>Competency</td>
<td>Institutional improvement/quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality assurance agencies/ accreditation bodies</td>
<td>Institution</td>
<td>System design (i.e. transfer)</td>
<td>Institution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National/jurisdictional governments</td>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>Labour market alignment and economic development</td>
<td>Nation/jurisdiction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International/regional government or non-governmental organisations</td>
<td>Credential</td>
<td>International coordination (and comparison)</td>
<td>International/regional</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**AHELO**
Mapping examples

1. OECD’s AHELO Feasibility Study Engineering Strand (AHELO)

2. Ontario Qualifications Framework (OQF)
### Map of AHELO and OQF policy activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Structural features</th>
<th>Policy formulation</th>
<th>Implementation</th>
<th>Evaluation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Actors</strong></td>
<td>Focus of expectation</td>
<td>Type of expectation</td>
<td>Common goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Programs</td>
<td>Generic skills</td>
<td>Learning objective</td>
<td>Transparency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutions</td>
<td>Program Learning outcome</td>
<td>Teaching and learning</td>
<td>Student (across courses)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discipline associations</td>
<td>Discipline Competency</td>
<td>Institutional improvement/quality</td>
<td>Program</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality assurance agencies/accreditation bodies</td>
<td>Institution</td>
<td>System design (i.e. transfer)</td>
<td>Institution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National/jurisdictional governments</td>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>Labour market alignment and economic development</td>
<td>Nation/jurisdiction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International/regional government or non-governmental organisations</td>
<td>Credential</td>
<td>International coordination (and comparison)</td>
<td>International/ regional</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**AHELO**

**OQF**

**AHELO and OQF**
Mapping examples

1. OECD’s AHELO Feasibility Study Engineering Strand (AHELO)

2. Ontario Qualifications Framework (OQF)

3. Badges
## Map of AHELO, OQF and Badges policy activities

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Structural features</th>
<th>Policy formulation</th>
<th>Implementation</th>
<th>Evaluation</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Actors</td>
<td>Focus of expectation</td>
<td>Type of expectation</td>
<td>Common goals</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Programs</td>
<td>Generic skills</td>
<td>Learning objective</td>
<td>Transparency</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Institutions</td>
<td>Program</td>
<td>Learning outcome</td>
<td>Teaching and learning</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Discipline associations</td>
<td>Discipline</td>
<td>Competency</td>
<td>Institutional improvement/quality</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quality assurance agencies/ accreditation bodies</td>
<td>Institution</td>
<td>System design (i.e. transfer)</td>
<td>Institution</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>National/jurisdictional governments</td>
<td>Sector</td>
<td>Labour market alignment and economic development</td>
<td>Nation/jurisdiction</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>International/regional government or non-governmental organisations</td>
<td>Credential</td>
<td>International coordination (and comparison)</td>
<td>International/regional</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### AHELO
- Focus of expectation: Generic skills
- Level of expectation: Transparency
- Strategy type: Articulation
- Activity: Writing learning outcomes
- Expected impact: Better skill-matching in labour market
- Evaluation of policy success: Are the primary goals being achieved?

### OQF
- Focus of expectation: Learning objective
- Level of expectation: Student (in course)
- Strategy type: Implementation
- Activity: Curriculum mapping
- Expected impact: Improved results of assessments
- Evaluation of policy success: Are there positive/negative impacts elsewhere?

### AHELO and OQF
- Focus of expectation: Learning objective
- Level of expectation: Student (in course)
- Strategy type: Implementation
- Activity: Curriculum mapping
- Expected impact: Improved results of assessments
- Evaluation of policy success: Are there positive/negative impacts elsewhere?

### Badges
- Focus of expectation: Learning objective
- Level of expectation: Student (in course)
- Strategy type: Implementation
- Activity: Curriculum mapping
- Expected impact: Improved results of assessments
- Evaluation of policy success: Are there positive/negative impacts elsewhere?

### OQF and Badges
- Focus of expectation: Learning objective
- Level of expectation: Student (in course)
- Strategy type: Implementation
- Activity: Curriculum mapping
- Expected impact: Improved results of assessments
- Evaluation of policy success: Are there positive/negative impacts elsewhere?

### All
- Focus of expectation: Learning objective
- Level of expectation: Student (in course)
- Strategy type: Implementation
- Activity: Curriculum mapping
- Expected impact: Improved results of assessments
- Evaluation of policy success: Are there positive/negative impacts elsewhere?
Exercise 1: Mapping your activities

• Identify a real or imagined learning outcomes activity
  – Consider the structural features
  – Map the policy formation and implementation activities

• Connect in small groups to discuss

• Report back
Exercise 2: Planning an evaluation

• Bring the policy plan into larger groups

• Identify one or two to work through the Evaluation phase

• Report back
Learning outcomes as a policy

Formulate | Implement | Evaluate
Thank you for your participation!

MaryCatharine.Lennon@Ontario.ca